

Table 1: Official Responses to World Bank Inspection Panel Claims

Before the 2nd Review of the Panel¹

Compiled by Bank Information Center, Updated July, 2002

Inspection Panel Claims ²	Bank Management Response	Panel Recommends Investigation	Board Approves Investigation	Outcome
1. Arun III Hydro Nepal Oct. 25 1994	Deny violations	Yes	Yes	Project cancelled.
2. Expropriation Ethiopia April 1995		Request not eligible		
3. Emergency Power VI Tanzania May 16, 1995		Request not eligible		
4. Rondonia Natural Resources Brazil June 16, 1995	Acknowledge some failures to comply	Yes	No, World Bank Action Plan was undertaken	Partial concessions to affected people.
5. Pangué Dam, IF Chile Nov. 1995		Not eligible, Panel has no jurisdiction in IFC		President Wolfensohn appoints independent investigator, Dr. Jay Hair.
6. Yacyreta Hydro Argentina and Paraguay Sept. 30, 1996	Deny violations	Yes	No, but permits limited "review and assessment" of Management Action Plan	Panel Report finds significant violations; some changes in project implementation.
7. Jamuna Bridge Bangladesh Aug. 18, 1996	Deny violations	No		Action Plan acceptable to claimants developed to remedy problems.
8. Jute Sector Bangladesh Nov. 13 1996	Deny violations	No		Panel determined investigation would not be useful. Loan closed in June 1997.
9. Itaparica Resettlement: Brazil March 12, 1997	Deny violations	Yes	No, Government proposed Action Plan	Bank supposed to supervise Action Plan; no significant progress on the ground.
10. Singrauli Coal India May 1, 1997	Acknowledges some failures to comply	Yes	Yes, but permits a limited desk review only	Local monitoring panel created; some project improvements, though violations persist.
11. Ecodevelopment, GEF India April 3, 1998	Acknowledges some failures to comply	Yes	No, Board agrees to review progress in 6 months	Management had six months to propose solutions. No significant progress on the ground.
12. Lesotho Highlands South Africa May 6, 1998	Deny violations	No		Panel found no evidence linking claims to the Bank's decision to proceed but felt that the claimants' concerns about conditions on the ground were valid.
13. Lagos Drainage Nigeria June 17, 1998	Deny violations	No		Borrower and IDA reached an agreement on compensation measures.
14. Cedula da Terra Land Reform Brazil Dec. 14, 1998 (1 st claim)	Deny violations	No		Panel found no evidence of harm.

(Continued)

Official Responses to World Bank Inspection Panel Claims (Continued)

After the 2nd Review of the Inspection Panel¹

Inspection Panel Claims ²	Bank Management Response	Panel Recommends Investigation	Board Approves Investigation	Outcome
15. Lesotho Highlands – Diamond April 26, 1999	Deny violations	No		Panel found no direct link between any action and/or omissions of the Bank with the harm claimed by the requester
16. Western Poverty Reduction China June 19, 1999	Acknowledges failure to comply	Yes	Yes	Panel finds significant violations. Project withdrawn by China in light of Board opposition.
17. Structural Adjustment Loan Argentina July 28, 1999	Deny violations	No		Claim found eligible but Bank Mgmt & GOA came to an understanding acceptable to claimants. GOA supplemented original allocation with additional allocation. Second tranche released by Bank.
18. Land Reform Brazil Sept. 14, 1999 (2 nd claim)	Deny violations	No		Panel finds that Requesters did not meet all eligibility criteria, thus denies inspection.
19. Lake Victoria Environmental Management Project Kenya Sept. 27, 1999	Deny violations	Yes	Yes	Panel finds violations. Board asks Mgmt to revise its response to improve its recommendations.
20. PRODEMINCA Ecuador December 17, 1999	Deny violations	Yes	Yes	Panel finds violations. Bank Mgmt and Board response pending.
21. Chad-Cameroon Pipeline Chad and Cameroon March 22, 2001	Deny violations	Yes	Yes	Pending
22. Coal Sector Project India June 21, 2001	Deny violations	Yes	Yes	Pending
23. Bujagali Hydropower Uganda July 27, 2001	Deny violations	Yes	Yes	Panel finds violations. Bank Mgmt presents Report and Recommendation in response to Panel. Discussion indefinitely postponed by MIGA Board of Directors.
24. Governance Promotion Adjustment Loan Papua New Guinea December 6, 2001	Deny violations	No		Panel found no direct link between any actions and/or omissions of the Bank with the harm claimed by the requester.
25. Yacyreta Hydro (Claim II) Argentina and Paraguay May 17, 2002	Pending	Pending	Pending	Pending

¹After several highly controversial claims were brought to the Panel, the Board decided in 1998 to undertake a “second review” of the Panel. (The first Panel Review was undertaken in 1996 to comply with the original mandate to review the Panel process after its first two years of operation.) That review, which was carried out by a Board committee during 1998, resulted in a proposal that would have significantly weakened the Panel. The draft proposal prompted NGOs to launch an international campaign to convince the Board that the Panel-and Bank accountability-needed to be strengthened not weakened. This campaign resulted in an unprecedented Board consultation with NGOs and claimants in March 1999, to hear their concerns. While the Panel procedures were ultimately altered and in some ways weakened, the consultation process improved the final outcome.

²The date listed for each claim is the date the Inspection Panel received the claim.

